

Committee(s):	Date(s):
Streets and Walkways Projects Sub Committee	13 January 2014 22 January 2014
Subject: Outcome Report - Paul's Walk Western End	Public
Report of: The Director of the Built Environment	For Decision
<u>Summary</u>	
<u>Dashboard</u>	
Project Status : Green	
Timeline indicating the stage at which the project is: Gateway 7	
Approved budget : £430,000 from Network Rail contribution	
Spend to Date : £430,000	
<u>Brief description of project</u>	
Paul's Walk Western End environmental enhancement scheme is part of the Riverside Enhancement Strategy, and was approved by Members in July 2008. This project aims to improve the western end of Paul's Walk and to complement the environmental enhancements completed in the eastern end of Paul's Walk and elsewhere along the Riverside Walk. It involves the following enhancements:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Terracing of the garden space adjacent to the walkways. The raised terraces allow people to sit with views out over the river wall to the river ; • New tree planting which also screens the walkway from the traffic noise from Upper Thames Street; • Improved lighting integrated into the design of the terraces and underneath the trees to add interest and safety at night; • New accessible seating for all users. 	
Following approval of the evaluation report in July 2008, Network Rail advised the City of London that they needed a temporary staircase in Paul's Walk to allow Blackfriars station to be redeveloped. The delay caused by Network Rail meant that any potential funding from Transport for London in that year would be lost to this project. Therefore, officers negotiated a sum of £430,000 from Network Rail in compensation to fund the scheme. The Transport for London funding was re-allocated to other projects on the Riverside and fully utilised.	
Further delays to the implementation of the scheme were caused by Network Rail needing to extend their license to use Paul's Walk Western end site until April 2013. Following further negotiation with Network Rail, Members approved a partnership with Network Rail in June 2011, whereby the implementation and labour costs of the project would be met by them, with the City paying for materials and costs. Works commenced in November 2012 and were completed in May 2013.	

Recommendations

It is recommended that Members approve:

- The closure of the project; and
- The additional staff costs of £2,503 to be met from the works and fees underspend on the project.

Overview

1. Evidence of Need	<p>The Paul's Walk project is part of the approved Riverside Walk Enhancement Strategy.</p> <p>The public consultation on the strategy and subsequently with users of Paul's Walk, revealed that there was strong need for enhancements at the Western end of Paul's Walk. The layout of this large area was overly complicated, with a succession of dated brick clad planters, seating spaces inaccessible to wheel chair users and planting in need of enhancement. Dark spaces felt unsafe and were regularly used by rough sleepers at night. Upper Thames Street was also a major source of discomfort for pedestrians both visually and through noise disturbance. In addition the river wall blocked views of the Thames when seated. As a result this area was under-used by the public and in many cases avoided in the evenings.</p>
2. Project Scope and Exclusions	N/A
3. Link to Strategic Aims	<p>This project has links to the following strategic aim:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• To provide modern, efficient and high quality local services and policing within the Square Mile for workers, residents and visitors with a view to delivering sustainable outcomes <p>This project has provided much needed amenity space and added asset value to the public realm for the benefit of local occupiers and visitors that use the area.</p> <p>The 'Thames and the Riverside' has been identified through the City's Core Strategy as a 'Key City Place', where the following policies apply:</p> <p>STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE 2 To ensure that the challenges facing the five Key City Places are met, complementing the core business function of the City, contributing to its unique character</p>

	<p>and distinguishing it from other global financial districts.</p> <p>The Vision: Thames and the Riverside The Thames and its riverside will provide well designed and managed public spaces, ranging from lively and vibrant areas, to areas of relative tranquillity for relaxation and contemplation. Residential, educational, recreational and employment activity will be enhanced by high quality sustainable streetscapes which will address the challenges of climate change.... The riverside will be easily accessible from other parts of the City and from the south side of the Thames.</p>
4. Within which category does the project fit	Fully reimbursable
5. What is the priority of the project?	Desirable
6. Resources Expended	The total cost of the project is £430,000 fully funded from a Network Rail contribution. Please see Appendix B for further details.

Outturn Assessment

7. Assessment of project against Success Criteria	<p>The scope of the project has not altered from the Committee approval and the scheme has achieved the following outcomes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accommodate the increasing numbers of City workers, residents and visitors using the Riverside Walk. Creation of an improved public space. <p><i>The scheme has enhanced a large green space on the City's Riverside Walk and includes a range of seating areas as well as lawn areas. The design was carefully developed in order to complement the materials and layout of the Riverside Walk and more specifically Paul's Walk Eastern End project. The result is a scheme that blends seamlessly with its surroundings and encourages greater use of the wider area and walking routes.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase variety of greenery and biodiversity <p><i>A total of twenty one trees have been planted, together with lavender shrubs and lawns. The new trees, plants and lawn area are particularly valued as they help to soften the environment, improve bio-diversity and create a more pleasant area to rest. The planting reduces dust and airborne pollution which is particularly beneficial given the close proximity of Victoria Embankment which is a polluted street.</i></p>
--	---

- Improvement of accessibility on the Riverside Walk for all street users of varying mobility
The scheme includes a greatly improved space and walking route along the Riverside with a significant width of a minimum of 3.8 metres to accommodate the increasing number of people using the area. New seats on two levels were included allowing people to sit and enjoy the view of the Thames as well as providing accessible seats for people with mobility impairments.
- Increase facility for leisure and relaxation in the public realm
Since completion of the project in May 2013, the area has been well used during the summer.

8. Programme

It was originally planned to commence Paul’s Walk Western End works in April 2010 and complete them within 6 months. However, Network Rail delayed the works due to several issues as detailed below.

- In January 2009, the project was firstly delayed due to Network Rail needing a licence for a temporary staircase from Blackfriars Rail Bridge to the Western end of Paul’s Walk to allow Blackfriars station to be redeveloped.
- Further delays to the project were due to Network Rail needing to extend the use of Paul’s Walk Western end site until April 2013. This ended up in further delays and negotiations with Network Rail and the new programme was presented and approved by Members in June 2011.
- Due to Network Rail delaying finalising the Letter of Agreement and the Olympic Games moratorium starting on 27th July 2012, works finally started in November 2012 and were completed in May 2013 with minor snagging works related to landscaping been carried out in September 2013.

9. Budget

The scheme has been completed within budget :

Description	Approved Budget (£)	Expenditure (£)	Variance (£)
Evaluation	24,365	24,365	0
Works	325,000	323,198	-1,802
Fees	34,664	33,963	-701
Staff Costs	45,971	48,474	+2,503*
TOTAL	430,000	430,000	0

*Additional staff costs were needed to liaise with Network Rail and their sub-contractors to get the snagging works completed as per the City Standards. This will be met from works and fees under-spends.
(See Appendix B for a more detailed breakdown).

10. Risk	The main project risks were as follows:	
	Risk	Mitigating Action
	Bespoke granite from China for the seats not delivered on time.	There was a delay in receiving the bespoke granite planters from China. However, they were considerably cheaper than European alternatives and as a result this element came in under budget
	Programme shifts as a result of Network Rail delays	The programme was extended to take account of the Network Rail needs for the redevelopment of the Blackfriars Station.
	CCTV camera location changes	There were delays to the works as a result of a CCTV camera being moved by Network Rail. The design needed to be updated to include the relocated CCTV camera.

11. Communications

Officers from the Built Environment Department worked closely with colleagues from the Open Spaces Department to deliver the project.

Officers also needed to work closely with representatives from Network Rail and their subcontractors from Balfour Beatty and Skidmores. As the works were carried out by Network Rail's contractors and not the City Term contractors, the project officer had to liaise closely with them and adapt to their communication process and documents.

The City's project management documentation, such as programmes, risk registers and communication plans, were used on a regular basis and helped the communication and the management of the project with all the external parties. The Project Management Documentation became the main source of information and was really helpful especially when new people from Network Rail or their sub-contractors joined the Project Team.

The Project Management Documentation helped to monitor the project at

	an early stage and identified clear risk owners. This was particularly efficient due to the complexity of the project structure and the high number of people from different parties involved in the project.
12. Benefits achieved to date	<p>The scheme has been successfully completed and the following benefits achieved:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A better used and more accessible walkway for all users; • Wider walkways and better paving; • 21 new trees ; • Approx. 200 Square meters of lavender and lawns; • Approx. 60 linear meters of seats which included 10 accessible seats; • New lighting.
13. Strategy for continued achievement of benefits	The space is maintained to the same high standards as other areas of highway and open spaces in the City.
14. Outstanding actions	N/A

Review of Team Performance

15. Governance arrangements	Regular project team meetings were organised to progress the project with the Project Manager, internal multidisciplinary project team consisting of Highways, Lighting, Open Spaces, City's contractors (Fountaineers, JB Riney) as well as Network Rail and their subcontractors carrying the works on site (Skidmores and Balfour Beatty).
16. Key strengths	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project was successfully achieved thanks to a very regular and close liaison with Network Rail and their subcontractors. The project communication was managed through a consistent use of the City's Project Management Documentation including project programmes, risk registers and communication plans. • A close supervision of the works carried out by Network Rail contractors by the City's Highways Team helped to monitor the works on site and notice any issues on a daily basis. Daily communication with the City's Project Manager

	<p>enabled a faster response to Network Rail when issues were raised during the implementation phase.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The successful design was developed through officers across City Departments having clear and coordinated input to the consultants work to achieve an integrated scheme.
17. Areas for improvement	<p>Working with Network Rail as the client and main contractor brought a number of challenges:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Network Rail changed the project manager 5 times during the lifetime of the project causing disruption and delays to the project. • Network Rail was involved in the project from the beginning of the design stage, however their full list of comments on the design was only received after the Construction Package was approved by the Highways Team, delaying the completion of the Construction Package. This was as a result of a lack of commitment and poor communication from Network Rail. • The CCTV camera located on Paul's Walk was moved by Network Rail and this was not communicated to the design team nor mentioned on the updated topographic survey provided by Network Rail. The new location of the CCTV camera conflicted with the design of the project. It would have been beneficial to have been informed by Network Rail of the new location of the CCTV camera to ensure that the drawings were updated at an early stage.
18. Special recognition	N/A

Lessons Learnt

19. Key lessons and how they will be used and applied	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Officers have learnt a lot about working with Network Rail and their sub-contractors. Their complex management processes required a very structured approach. The consistent use of the City's Project Management Documentation was very useful to the project development and enabled quick decisions to be taken when issues arose. • The Project Manager developed negotiation and communication skills and this is to be used in the
--	---

	management and delivery of future projects. <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Bringing the scheme in on budget as a result of close monitoring of scheme costs.
--	---

Appendices

Appendix 1	Before and after pictures
Appendix 2	Table 1: Final Out-turn Costs

Contact

Report Author	Clarisse Tavin
Email Address	Clarisse.tavin@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	0207 332 3634

Appendix A

Before and after pictures



Before



After



Before



After

Appendix B

Table 1: Final Out-turn Costs

Description	Approved Budget (£)	Expenditure (£)	Variance (£)
Evaluation (16100169)			
Evaluation	24,365	24,365	0
Evaluation Total :	24,365	24,365	0
Design & Implementation (16100228)			
Works			
Materials	305,000	304,472	-528
Irrigation System & Pipe Subway Works	17,000	16,225	-775
Removal of Trees	3,000	2,501	-499
Works Sub-Total :	325,000	323,198	-1,802
Fees			
Design Fees	17,000	16,700	-300
Other Fees	17,664	17,263	-401
Fees Sub-Total :	34,664	33,963	-701
CoL Staff Costs			
Built Environment (Planning) - <i>Design Costs</i>	8,412	8,412	0.00
Built Environment (Planning) - Implementation	26,000	29,325	+3,325
Built Environment (Highways) - <i>Design Costs</i>	1,559	1,559	0
Built Environment (Highways) - Implementation	5,000	5,000	0
Open Spaces Department - Implementation	5,000	4,178	-822
CoL Staff Costs Sub-Total :	45,971	48,474	+2,503
Design & Implementation Total :	405,635	405,635	0
GRAND TOTALS	430,000	430,000	0